

# CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN & HAMILTON LLP

One Liberty Plaza  
New York, NY 10006-1470

T: +1 212 225 2000

F: +1 212 225 3999

clearygottlieb.com


WASHINGTON, D.C. • PARIS • BRUSSELS • LONDON • MOSCOW  
FRANKFURT • COLOGNE • ROME • MILAN • HONG KONG  
BEIJING • BUENOS AIRES • SÃO PAULO • ABU DHABI • SEOUL

D: +1 212-225-2490  
jblackman@cgsh.com

THOMAS J. MOLONEY  
DAVID G. SABEL  
JONATHAN I. BLACKMAN  
RICHARD S. LINCER  
JAMES A. DUNCAN  
STEVEN M. LOEB  
CRAIG B. BROD  
NICOLAS GRABAR  
CHRISTOPHER E. AUSTIN  
HOWARD S. ZELBO  
DAVID E. BRODSKY  
ARTHUR H. KOHN  
RICHARD J. COOPER  
JEFFREY S. LEWIS  
PAUL J. SHIM  
STEVEN L. WILNER  
ERIKA W. NIJENHUIS  
ANDRES DE LA CRUZ  
DAVID C. LOPEZ  
MICHAEL A. GERSTENZANG  
LEWIS J. LIMAN  
LEV L. DASSIN  
NEIL Q. WHORISKEY  
JORGE U. JUANTORENA  
MICHAEL D. WEINBERGER  
DAVID LEHWAND  
DIANA L. WOLLMAN  
JEFFREY A. ROSENTHAL  
ETHAN A. KLINGSBERG  
MICHAEL D. DAYAN  
CARMINE D. BOCCUZZI, JR.  
JEFFREY D. KARPFF  
KIMBERLY BROWN BLACKLOW  
ROBERT J. RAYMOND  
SUNG K. KANG  
LEONARD C. JACOBY  
SANDRA L. FLOW  
FRANCISCO L. CESTERO

FRANCESCA L. ODELL  
WILLIAM L. MORAE  
JASON FACTOR  
JOON H. KIM  
MARGARET S. PEONIS  
LISA M. SCHWEITZER  
JUAN G. GIRÁLDEZ  
DUANE MCLAUGHLIN  
BREON S. PEACE  
MEREDITH E. KOTLER  
CHANTAL E. KORDULA  
BENET J. O'REILLY  
ADAM E. FLEISHER  
SEAN A. O'NEAL  
GLENN P. MCGORRY  
MATTHEW P. SALERNO  
MICHAEL J. ALBANO  
VICTOR L. HOU  
ROGER A. COOPER  
AMY R. SHAPIRO  
JENNIFER KENNEDY PARK  
ELIZABETH LENAS  
LUKE A. BAREFOOT  
PAMELA L. MARCOGLIESE  
PAUL M. TIGER  
JONATHAN S. KOLODNER  
DANIEL ILAN  
MEYER H. FEDIDA  
ADRIAN R. LEIPSI  
ELIZABETH VICENS  
ADAM J. BRENNEMAN  
ARI D. MACKINNON  
JAMES E. LANGSTON  
JARED GERBER  
COLIN D. LLOYD  
COREY M. GOODMAN  
RISHI ZUTSHI  
JANE VANLARE

DAVID H. HERRINGTON  
KIMBERLY R. SPOERRI  
AARON J. MEYERS  
DANIEL C. REYNOLDS  
ABENA A. MAINOO  
HUGH C. CONROY, JR.  
JOSEPH LANZKRON  
MAURICE R. GINDI  
KATHERINE R. REAVES  
RAHUL MUKHI  
RESIDENT PARTNERS  
SANDRA M. ROCKS  
S. DOUGLAS BORISKY  
JUDITH KASSEL  
DAVID E. WEBB  
PENELOPE L. CHRISTOPHOROU  
BOAZ S. MORAG  
MARY E. ALCOCK  
HEIDE H. LIGENFRITZ  
KATHLEEN M. EMBERGER  
AVRAM E. LUFT  
ANDREW WEAVER  
HELENA K. GRANNIS  
JOHN V. HARRISON  
CAROLINE F. HAYDAY  
NEIL R. MARKEL  
KENNETH S. BLAZEJEWSKI  
ANDREA M. BASHAM  
LAURA BAGARELLA  
SHIRLEY M. LO  
JONATHAN D.W. GIFFORD  
SUSANNA E. PARKER  
RESIDENT COUNSEL  
LOUISE M. PARENT  
OF COUNSEL

APPLICATION GRANTED  
SO ORDERED   
VERNON S. BRODERICK  
U.S.D.J. 10/21/2019

VIA ECF

The Honorable Vernon S. Broderick  
United States District Court for the Southern District of New York  
40 Foley Square  
New York, NY 10007  
BroderickNYSDChambers@nysd.uscourts.gov

Re: *Vale S.A. v. BSG Resources Limited*, No. 19-cv-3619

Dear Judge Broderick:

We write on behalf of Vale S.A. (“Vale”), the petitioner in the above-captioned summary proceeding for recognition and enforcement of Vale’s arbitral award (the “Award”) against BSG Resources Limited (“BSGR”), regarding BSGR’s October 18, 2019 letter asking this Court to defer ruling on Vale’s Petition and to stay enforcement of the Award (“BSGR’s Letter”) [ECF No. 33].

Rather than simply setting forth its position on whether the “sole ground for opposing recognition and enforcement in the United States . . . is now moot” as required by your Honor’s October 4, 2019 Order [ECF No. 32], BSGR’s Letter offers extensive argument on its claimed alternative grounds for relief and raises an entirely new issue regarding potential injunctive relief. Accordingly, Vale respectfully requests the Court’s permission to file a brief response to BSGR’s Letter by October 25, 2019.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jonathan I. Blackman

cc: Frederick Hyman, Esq.  
Michael R. Lastowski, Esq.